

VU Research Portal

God Remembers

Pakpahan, B.J.

2011

document version

Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

[Link to publication in VU Research Portal](#)

citation for published version (APA)

Pakpahan, B. J. (2011). *God Remembers: Towards a Theology of Remembrance as a Basis of Reconciliation in Communal Conflict*. [PhD-Thesis – Research external, graduation internal, Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam].

General rights

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

- Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
- You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal ?

Take down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

E-mail address:

vuresearchportal.ub@vu.nl

Table of contents

Acknowledgment	... 6
Chapter 1 Introduction	... 6
1. 1 Signs of a growing culture of remembrance	... 8
1. 2 To remember or to forget?	... 9
1. 3 What is remembrance?	... 11
1. 4 Shared memory and reconciliation	... 13
1. 5 Remembrance of conflict in the church	... 15
1. 6 Christian remembrance	... 17
1. 7 The research question	... 19
1. 8 Development of the argument	... 19
Chapter 2 The wounds of the past in the Huria Kristen Batak Protestan	... 21
2.1 Huria Kristen Batak Protestan (HKBP/Batak Protestant Christian Church)	... 21
2.1.1 A brief history of the Church	... 21
2.1.2 The influence of Batak's culture in HKBP	... 22
2.1.3 The structure of the Church	... 24
2.2 The HKBP 1992-1998 crisis	... 27
2.2.1 The beginning of the conflict	... 29
2.2.2 Conflict between ephorus and secretary general	... 31
2.2.3 The 51 st General Synod	... 32
2.2.4 The Inauguration of Rev. S.M. Siahaan as Acting Ephorus	... 36
2.2.5 The Extraordinary General Synod February 11-13, 1993	... 39
2.2.6 Two conflicting groups	... 41
2.3 The confrontations	... 43
2.3.1 Legal confrontation	... 43
2.3.2 Physical confrontation	... 46
2.3.3 Separation of congregations	... 48
2.4 Reconciliation efforts	... 49
2.4.1 Reconciliation effort within the Church	... 49
2.4.2 Reconciliation effort by Communion of Churches in Indonesia (Persekutuan Gereja-gereja di Indonesia/PGI)	... 51
2.4.3 Reconciliation effort by government representatives	... 54
2.4.4 The 1998 Reconciliation General Synod	... 55
2.4.5 After the 1998 Reconciliation General Synod	... 57
2.5 Analysis of the conflict	... 59
2.5.1 An anthropological analysis	... 59
2.5.2 A political- theological analysis	... 62
2.5.3 A church-political analysis	... 64
2.5.4 Was the 1998 Reconciliation General Synod enough?	... 67
2.6 Conclusion	... 68
Chapter 3 Biblical meaning of remembrance	... 69
3.1 Social memory in biblical context	... 70
3.2 Remembrance in the Old Testament	... 72

3.2.1	The role of memory in the Old Testament community	... 72
3.2.2	“Zākhar” as the central expression for remembrance in the Old Testament	... 75
3.2.3	Etymology, occurrences, contexts, and usages	... 76
3.2.4	Hebrew psychology of memory	... 78
3.3	Aspects of remembrance in the Old Testament	... 80
3.3.1	God remembers people	... 80
3.3.2	People remember God	... 84
3.3.3	The cultic representation of the past	... 86
3.4	Remembrance in connection with forgiveness and reconciliation	... 88
3.4.1	Book of Hosea: God remembers sins	... 89
3.4.2	Malachi 3:16: The book of remembrance	... 91
3.4.3	Nehemiah 9:1-37: The great confession of sins	... 93
3.4.4	Jeremiah 31:34: God remembers sins no more	... 94
3.5	Remembrance in the New Testament	... 95
3.5.1	The role of memory in the early communities in Jesus’ time	... 95
3.5.2	Linguistic analysis of memory in the New Testament	... 99
3.5.3	Anamnesis in Hebrew 10:3: the memorial of sins	... 102
3.6	Anamnesis in the Eucharist	... 103
3.6.1	The four texts	... 104
3.6.2	The Eucharist and God who remembers	... 105
3.6.3	The Eucharist and the Passover	... 106
3.6.4	The Eucharist and sacrificial act	... 110
3.7	Conclusion	... 112
Chapter 4 Remembrance and theology		... 114
4.1	Johann Baptist Metz: <i>Memoria passionis</i> as dangerous memory	... 114
4.1.1	The bourgeois church; middle class religion; and the post-bourgeois world	... 118
4.1.2	Political theology	... 119
4.1.3	Memory and time	... 121
4.1.4	Dangerous memory: <i>Memoria passionis</i>	... 124
4.1.5	Memory of the suffering?	... 126
4.1.6	Flora Keshkegian: Redeeming memories for healing and transformation	... 127
4.2	Alexander Schmemmann: The Eucharist and liturgical memory	... 132
4.2.1	Crisis in the church	... 134
4.2.2	Liturgical theology	... 136
4.2.3	The central place of the Eucharist	... 138
4.2.4	Liturgy of time	... 140
4.2.5	Sacrament of remembrance	... 142
4.2.6	Joyous communal memory	... 145
4.2.7	Liturgical theology and political theology in dialogue	... 146
4.3	Miroslav Volf: The end of memory	... 148
4.3.1	Volf’s view on forgiveness	... 151
4.3.2	The role of memory	... 152
4.3.3	Remember truthfully	... 154
4.3.4	A community of remembrance	... 156
4.3.5	The end of memory?	... 157
4.4	Metz, Schmemmann, and Volf in dialogue	... 159

Chapter 5	Remembrance in liturgy of the Eucharist	... 163
5.1	Liturgy and remembrance	... 163
5.1.1	The contribution of the three theologians in the liturgy of the Eucharist	... 169
5.1.2	Elements of the Eucharist	... 170
5.1.2.1	The Eucharist as an act of confession	... 170
5.1.2.2	The Eucharist and forgiveness of sins	... 171
5.1.2.3	The Eucharist as table of reconciliation	... 173
5.2	The elements of the Eucharist in the BEM Document	... 173
5.2.1	The elements of the BEM eucharistic liturgy	... 177
5.2.1.1	Service of the Word	... 178
5.2.1.2	Intercession prayer	... 180
5.2.1.3	Eucharistic Prayer	... 181
5.2.2	Lima Liturgy of the Eucharist	... 183
5.3	The Liturgy of the HKBP	... 186
5.3.1	Order of the Sunday service	... 186
5.3.2	The preparation service for the celebration of the Eucharist	... 190
5.3.3	The eucharistic liturgy after the preparation service	... 194
5.3.4	The eucharistic liturgy without the preparation service	... 197
5.4	Eucharistic liturgy: a space for healing memories	... 200
5.4.1	Proposed preparation service of the Eucharist	... 201
5.4.2	Proposed eucharistic liturgy after preparation service	... 203
5.5	Conclusion	... 207
Chapter 6	Conclusion: God remembers	... 209
6.1	The importance of remembrance	... 209
6.2	To create redemptive memory	... 210
6.3	The Eucharist and justice	... 214
6.4	Epilogue	... 216
	Samenvatting (Summary in Dutch)	... 218
	Rangkuman (Summary in Indonesian)	... 222
	List of Abbreviations	... 228
	Bibliography	... 229
	Biography	... 242